

# Civil Servant Teacher Recruitment Process in Indonesia: Study Case on Civil Servant Teacher in West Nusa Tenggara Province

Sri Trisnawati<sup>1</sup> and Nik Mohd Rahimi<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup>Faculty of Education, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, Malaysia

Emai: <sup>1</sup>[wsritrisna@gmail.com](mailto:wsritrisna@gmail.com) and <sup>2</sup>[nik@ukm.edu.my](mailto:nik@ukm.edu.my)

**Abstract**— The process of civil servant teacher recruitment in Indonesia is conducted every year to recruit teacher professionally. The recruitment process has been conducted and enhanced in Indonesia throughout years from pre paper-based test in 2013 to Computer Assisted Test (CAT) in the same year-present. The aim of this research is to do a deeper exploring of the current process of civil servant teacher recruitment in Indonesia through qualitative case study in which the online interview has been conducted to 6 civil servant teachers in West Nusa Tenggara who took the recruitment test in 2019. Furthermore, this study found that there are several significant differences in the process of recruitment especially for the teacher who took the test under ministry of religious affair that they did not only require to do Computer Assisted Test (CAT) but also interview and micro teaching test in which other candidate who applied to become civil servant teacher in another institution did not require to do those tests. In addition, this study discovered that throughout the recruitment process the teachers faced some challenges such as the regulation of passing grade *Basic Competences Test* and *Personal Characteristic Test* is too high and biased. In addition, the questions for *Basic Competences Test* is excessively subjective and it makes the participant face difficulties in answering the questions. Nevertheless, through the Computer Assisted Test (CAT) there is no more bribery, nepotism, discrimination and violation rule (cheating) in the process of civil servant teacher recruitment that has been an issue in the previous recruitment process.

**Keywords**— Civil Servant Teacher, Recruitment, Computer Assisted Test

## I. INTRODUCTION

Based on the results of the Program for International Student Assessment (PISA) in 2018 shows that the reading scores of Indonesian students are at their lowest point since Indonesia assessment in 2000 in which Indonesia only obtained 71.9% in basic mathematics competencies (the 2<sup>nd</sup> lowest level on the PISA scale). In other words, Indonesia ranks 7th lowest out of 77 countries surveyed (Aris R Huang, et.al 2020). One of the root causes of the low quality of education in

Indonesia is the low quality of teachers (Aris R. Huang, et.al, 2020). Since 2012-2015, 1.3 million of the 1.6 million teachers who took the *Teacher Competency Test -this exam measured competence in managing learning and understanding of the subjects taught*-did not reach the minimum score (Aris R Huang, et al, 2020).

Teachers have an important role in improving the quality of education because they are the main pillar in shaping students as the nation's next generation. However, apart from the *Teacher Competency Test* results in Indonesia which do not reach the minimum score, Indonesia also faces issues related to the number of teachers is needed in Indonesia (Kompas Pedia, 2020 & Seidoo, 2020). Whereas in a national seminar entitled *National Education Conference in 2020*, Supriano who is the General Director of Teachers and Education of the Ministry of Education that Indonesia lacked 3,017,000 of teachers until 2024. While the data on the number of teachers in Indonesia currently is 2,698,103 teachers in which the number is consist of civil servant teachers and temporary teachers based on statistical data from the Ministry of Education for the 2019/2020 school year (Kompas Pedia, 2020 & Seidoo, 2020).

In addition to the issue of teacher recruitment process, based on a study conducted by Aris S. Huang, et.al. in 2020 that Indonesia has difficulty recruiting qualified teachers due to a mismatch of data between the needs required by schools and the number of teacher that government purpose on the recruitment process and the recruitment process only measured the level of knowledge domain skills of the teachers. Furthermore, there are no differences in the teacher recruitment process as other civil servant recruitment process in other public sector. Aris R Huang, et al, 2020 also stated teacher recruitment process In Indonesia is too centralized on the central government without seeing the needs of the various regions and diversity in Indonesia, and the change from paper-based tests to CAT (Computer Assessment Test) in 2019 to overcome the issue of violation e.g. the use of *Joki* (using other people who has been paid to replace the teacher in answering the test), and nepotism that often occurs during the

teacher recruitment process. Thus, this study was carried out because there was a lack of studies related to the process of teacher recruitment process in Indonesia.

Concisely, the research objective on this study namely: 1) To explore the experience of teachers who undertook civil servant teacher recruitment process in West Nusa Tenggara Province in Indonesia; & 2) To explore the challenges of the civil servant teacher recruitment process in West Nusa Tenggara Province in Indonesia

**II. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

**Study Design and Sample Size**

A qualitative case study is conducted to do this research in which to explore the experience of civil servant teacher who took the recruitment test in 2019 in West Nusa Tenggara Province of Indonesia. In accordance with Pat Barzeley (2013) stated that a resecher who conducted qualitative study heed on analyzing and interpreting people experience, behavior, and their view/perception about themselves and their surroundings. Meanwhile Woodsie. G (2013) define cased study based on Yin (1994) definition that cased study is not merely about investigating the extant phenomenon but also heed on describing as well as comprehending conspicuously i.e. a person/individual

organization, community, and others in achieving a exhaustive comprehension in the phenomenon or case. In line with those two definitions about qualitative cased study, this research has been conducted to achieve a precisely understanding about the recruitment process of civil servant teacher in Indonesia through the teacher experiences who took the test in 2019. Furthermore, in choosing the sample to this research, we used purposive sampling in which Sharan B. Meriam (1998) delineated regarding about the use of purposive sampling in qualitative research based on Paton (1990) definition that purposive sampling is used where the investigator wants to understand and obtain the insight of the sample that can be studied. Subsequently, since this study used purposive sampling therefore, there are some criteria that the researcher determined namely:

1. A civil servant teacher who took the test in 2019
2. A civil servant teacher who undertook the recruitment process and placement in West Nusa Tenggara province Indonesia.

In accordance with those criteria, this study obtained 6 participants as sample for this research. However, further information about the participants are displayed in the table below:

*Table 1. A Brief Information about 6 Participants*

General Information	Gender	Placement
Participant 01 (P01): A Civil Servant Teacher of Civic Education in Senior High School. The Government of West Nusa Tenggara Province	Male	West Sumbawa regency of West Nusa Tenggara Province
Participant 02 (P02): A Civil Servant Teacher of Civic Education in Senior High School. The Government of West Nusa Tenggara Province	Female	East Lombok regency of West Nusa Tenggara Province
Participant 03 (P03): A Civil Servant Teacher of Civic Education in Junior High School. The government of North Lombok	Male	North Lombok regency of West Nusa Tenggara Province
Participant 04 (P04): A Civil Servant Teacher of Civic Education in Senior High School. The government of West Sumbawa Regency	Female	West Sumbawa Regency of West Nusa Tenggara Province
Participant 05 (P05): A Civil Servant Teacher of Civic Education in Senior High School. The government of Central Lombok Regency	Female	Central Lombok Regency of West Nusa Tenggara Province
Participant 06 (P06): A Civil Servant Teacher of Civic Education in Madrasah Aliyah. Ministry of Religious Affair of Indonesia.	Male	Bima (city), West Nusa Tenggara Province

**Instrumental and Data Collection**

Subsequently, the researchers decided to use the interview to gain an understanding of the experiences and challenges faced by civil servant teachers during the recruitment process. Along with that, Sharan B. Meriam (1998) says that interview is the most common form of

collecting qualitative data where one obtains information from others. It also states that interviews need to be conducted if the researchers are unable to make observations to find out the behavior of participants.

Sharan B. Meriam also stated that interview is needed when research should analyze past events where the researcher does not have the possibility to replicate those events.

However, for the past event in this study is the recruitment test for civil servants in West Nusa Tenggara Province in 2019.

As such, the interview in this study was conducted using social media (WhatsApp) due to the Covid-19 pandemic and the distance between researchers and participants, where participants are in Indonesia and the researchers in Malaysia.

**Data Analysis**

Ensuingly, in analyzing the data, this study adapted H. O'Connor & N. Gibson (2003) methods in which the researchers used table to reduce and organize data such as well as to display the finding. However, in doing

**Ethical Consideration**

This study has been gained consent and permission from all the participants in conducting the research in which

the researcher asked their approval to be research participants.

**III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION**

Based on the findings of the study from the interview process has been conducted on 6 participants, the discussion in this report is categorized into 4 parts, namely:

**Civil Servant Teacher Recruitment Process**

This study found that the teacher recruitment process that has been traversed by 6 participants went smoothly and systematically.

In addition, every information required by the participants was obtained clearly and distinctly. the participants also experienced ease in accessing the required information.

This is due to the recruitment process in 2019 was conducted through online system and it has clear guidelines and easy to be followed by the participants.

*Table 2. Transcript of the interview in the recruitment process of civil servant teacher*

Participant	Answer
P02	<i>“The guideline is clear and BKN provided us on their websites and any of their social media as well as the institution websites in which we enrolled. We also can access and download it there. Through the website, we also can choose the institution in which has the least number of participants, so we have lower number of competitors in getting the place that we enrolled and many more. All in all, the access of the information and recruitment process is at full tilt, clear and easy.</i>
P03	<i>In my opinion, the recruitment has been conducted very clearly and systematically since the guideline has been provided in the website of BKN or BKD. In addition, the BKD also informed us regularly and gradually any further information regarding the recruitment process.</i>
P04	<i>“The guidance has been given from BKN is clear, easy, and systematic because everything was done online. There is no discrimination and nepotism as well during the recruitment process”</i>

Based on the transcript of the interview above, it shows the findings in line with what has been described by Ahmad Fauzan (2018) and Harky (2018) whereas it is important to ensure a transparent recruitment process from corrupt activities or any dishonest activities.

Since the recruitment process has a key role that will be the basis for the quality of an organization in the future.

In addition, based on a study conducted by Aris R. Huang, et al. in 2020, in which the change from paper-based tests conducted since 2013 to CAT were made due to frequent violations of test conditions such as being

involved in corruption, nepotism, and using the services of a *Joki* (someone who has been paid to replaces participants) in the process of hiring new teachers in Indonesia.

**Significant differences in Civil Servant Teacher Recruitment Process of each institutions**

Correspondingly, this study also found that there are significant differences of the process in teacher recruitment based on the institution and the region that participant enrolled.

*Table 2. Transcript of the interview of the difference in recruitment process of civil servant teacher*

Participant	Answer
-------------	--------

P01	<i>"As for candidates who applied under the government of province has the same process with the civil servant recruitment in general, except for the type of the questions especially in Field Competency Test. Yet, for Ministry of Religion Affair the test is more detailed because there is a teaching practice in it"</i>
P02	<i>"Yes, if like the Ministry of Religion Affair there are an interview test, and also teaching test. For the province institution that I took, there are two tests, namely the basic competency test and the field competency test"</i>
P06	<i>"Since I applied civil servant teacher test in the Ministry of Religion Affair, so I need to do some test such as interview and microteaching. In the microteaching we are told to make lesson plans, and learning media, we must implement lesson plans that we made. If in the interview is asked about integrity, professionalism at work, addressing racial issues, national and state issues"</i>

Although the recruitment process for new teachers who will have the status of civil servant teacher in Indonesia has the same process as the recruitment process for other civil servant employees (Aris R. Huang, et.al 2020), but this study found out there are differences in the recruitment process between teachers who take formations under the government in provincial, district, and other institution e.g. Ministry of Religion Affair. Where this significant difference can especially be found in the process of taking new civil servant teachers carried out by the Ministry of Religion in Indonesia. In the tests that are applied, not only do they test the ability of general knowledge domains and fields, but there is a process of interviewing, psychological testing and micro teaching to the examinees who applied in this institution.

***The challenges in the civil servant teacher recruitment process***

The finding of this study discovered that the teacher who applied for the civil servant teacher’s recruitment process in 2019 faced some challenges during the recruitment such as the administration process that

The results of the study is contrary with the study conducted by Ari S. Huang, et.al (2020), in which the study found that it was difficult to recruit the ideal teacher because the process of taking new teachers was only to fulfill administrative formalities and measure the domain of knowledge abilities. However, those test processes were only found in teachers who applied under the formation of the Ministry of Religion Affair. Meanwhile, those who apply under the district and provincial government formations have the same recruitment process as other civil servant employees. Nevertheless, the finding of this study is in line with the Pahos, N., & Galanski, E. (2018) that it required to do some competences test such as personalities, self-concept, skill, and knowledge to recruit the best employee to work.

make the participant exhausted in which they have to submit and collect the document multiple times, the bias in the questions of the test, and the passing grade issue that felt unfair to all participant that took the test.

Those challenges are displayed on the interview below:

*Table 3 The transcripts of the interview on the challenge of the civil servant teacher recruitment process*

Participant	Answer
P01	<i>"The biggest challenge is on the Basic Competency Test in which there were 3 kinds of test and the most difficult one is personal characteristic test to the extent that most of the participants fail this test because the passing grade is very high and the questions are relatively subjective"</i>
P02	<i>"The most difficult test is the Basic Competency Test in which there are 100 questions consist of 3 types of test such as insight nationality test, the intelligence test and personality test. Among those three, the personality test was the most difficult one even I failed the test once since we need to write a very long answer, and the passing grade is high"</i>
P04	<i>"The most exhausted process in which me and my friends need to be hospitalized is the administration phase after we passed the test. We have to re-submitted the document that we have been collected in the first phase of the recruitment. We did it multiple times since there were misinformation from the institution that I applied regarding the required document that need to be submitted."</i>

Pahos. N & Galansky, N (2018) explained that in the recruitment process it was necessary to see and estimate

the competence of the individual who is applying for the job. The competencies referred to

traits/characteristics, knowledge, and skills. Furthermore, the process of the recruitment the new civil servant teachers in Indonesia also overlook the three competencies, namely *The Intelligence Competency Test*, *Nationality Insight Test*, and *Personality test* in *Basic Competency Test*. However, participants experienced challenges in answering questions, especially for *Basic Competency Test*, especially on personality tests where there was a high passing grade with many questions that need long answers. This competency test and the passing grade

system in the study obtained by Ari S. Huang, et.al (2020) are not sufficient to identify the extent of the teaching ability of the examinees.

***The improvement in the civil servant teacher recruitment process***

Beside to explore the process of recruitment process and the challenges faced by the participant. This study also provides questions regarding what improvements are needed to enhance the process of recruiting new teachers in Indonesia.

*Table 4 The transcripts of the interview on the improvement of the civil servant teacher recruitment process*

Participant	Answer
P01	<i>"The process is good, but the bad thing is, there are things that are too forced in term of the passing grade score. In the other case, even though the participant score in the Basic Competence Test is really bad, but as long as it is higher than the other rival, the participant will still pass the test"</i>
P02	<i>"In my opinion, the recruitment process need to be improved because the recruitment only measure at the extent of teacher knowledge in the subject that they taught. Meanwhile, to recruit ideal teachers, there are additional tests are needed such as pedagogic competence, or professional competence as teacher."</i>
P03	<i>"The regulation in which gave a privilege for the teacher who already has educator certificate to pass the test even though they got the lower score than other participants must be removed since it will not fair for us who struggle and give our effort in answering all those questions"</i>
P06	<i>"After the recruitment process, I think the government need to provide the teacher who are successful in the recruitment process some training to enhance their knowledge and skill in teaching"</i>

The improvements needed in the process of taking the ideal teacher in the selection of future civil servant teachers such as 1). Reviewing regulations related to passing grades for the competency tests. Whereas if the participants are not successful in obtaining a minimum score than the predetermined passing grade, then they still can succeed on the condition that the participant is in the top 3 of the highest scores. 2) Reviewing the privileges given to participants who have educator certificates where they are given the right to pass the test even though they get scores below the standard, and 3) The teacher recruitment test is not only test-based form, but requires a teaching practice, especially for teachers who apply for formation under the provincial and district governments.

Those statements are in line with the results of a study conducted by Aris S. Huang, et.al in 2020 in which to recruit an ideal new teacher it is also necessary to take a test that can see the extent of the teacher's ability to teach. In addition, based on a study conducted by Kusmuwardhani in 2017, the educator certificate policy did not obtain significant results in improving the quality of teacher in teaching. Therefore this regulation need to be reviewed regarding the privileges in which they still able to pass the test even though they got the

lower score or did not meet the minimum passing grade for teachers who have obtained educator certificates

**IV. IMPLICATION OF STUDY**

Based on the studies that have been carried out, the implications of this study are as follows:

1. The Indonesian National Civil Service Agency in which responsible for the process of managing the recruitment of new teachers in Indonesia holds teaching practice tests and interviews at each agency.
2. Reflecting on the Basic Competency Test and the predetermined of the passing grade as well as the policy regarding the use of educator certificates in the graduation assessment process.

Thus, the results of this study proposed future study that can be carried out in quantitative study on a larger and wider scale involving several regions in Indonesia since this study only focuses on high school and junior high school civil servant teachers who teach in the field of Pancasila and Citizenship Education therefore, the future study can be carried out on a larger and wider scale involving several regions in Indonesia using quantitative studies in the form of questionnaire and survey.

## V. CONCLUSSION

Based on the studies that have been carried out, the process of civil servant teacher's recruitment in Indonesia is well executed, has clear guidelines from the beginning to the end although there are several challenges such as the margin score in which is still an issue in the basic competences selection and the form of questions which is too complicated. Thus, the improvements in terms of administration phase of the selection is needed and the micro teaching test is suggested to all the institution which is not only for the competence in testing the teacher domain of knowledge.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT

Thank to En. Jamalulail Bin Abdul Wahab and Dr. Aida Hanim Binti Hamid for the assistances and reviews during this study was conducted to submit the mini-research assignment on Human Resource Management in Education course.

## REFERENCES

- [1] Ahmad Faizuan. 2018. Nepotisme dalam Proses Pengambilan dan Pemilihan Pekerja oleh Organisasi: Satu Penilaian. *Trends in Undergraduate Research*, 1(1), 6-10
- [2] Arch G. Woodside. 2013. *Case Study Research: Theory. Methods. Practice*. Emerald: Bingley.
- [3] Aris R Huang, Shintia Sevina, Rizki Filliali, & Akhamdi. 2020. The Struggle to Recruit Good Teachers in Indonesia: Institutional and Social Dysfunctions. *Rise Working Paper-Vol 20-041* June 2020.
- [4] H. O'Connor & N. Gibson, "A Step by Step Guide to Qualitative Analysis" 2003. Pimatiziwin: A Journal of Aboriginal and Indigenous Community Health 1(1)
- [5] Kompas Pedia. Jumlah Guru di Indonesia (Peta Tematik Hari Guru). 24 November 2020. Retrieved from [https://kompaspedia.kompas.id/baca/infografik/peta-tematik/jumlah-guru-di-indonesia#:~:text=Berdasarkan%20data%20statistik%20dari%20laman,2020%20mencapai%202.698.103%20orang](https://kompaspedia.kompas.id/baca/infografik/peta-tematik/jumlah-guru-di-indonesia#:~:text=Berdasarkan%20data%20statistik%20dari%20laman,2020%20mencapai%202.698.103%20orang.). [11 December 2020]
- [6] Kusumawardhani, P., 2017. Does teacher certification program lead to better quality teachers? Evidence from Indonesia. *Education Economics*, 25(6), pp.590-618.
- [7] Pahos, N., & Galanski, E. 2018. Staffing practices and employee performance: The role of age. *Evidence-based HRM: A Global Forum for Empirical Scholarship*. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1108/EBHRM-01-2018-0007>.
- [8] Pat Bezeley. 2013. *Qualitative Data Analysis*. Sage Publication Ltd.
- [9] Rahmad Said. 2011. *Analisis Data Penelitian Kualitatif Model Miles Dan Huberman*. Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta.
- [10] Sharan B. Meriam. 1998. *Qualitative Research and Case Study Applications in Education*. Jossey-Bass higher and adult education series.
- [11] Siedoo. *Memprihatinkan, Indonesia Kekurangan 3 Juta Guru, Bagaimana Solusinya...* Siedoo-Mengupas pendidikan dari pelosok negeri. 13 Februari 2019. Retrieved From <https://siedoo.com/berita-16691-memprihatinkan-indonesia-kekurangan-3-juta-guru-bagaimana-solusinya/>. [11 Desember 2020]
- [12] Yashir Fadel Muhammad Harky. 2018. The Significance of Recruitment and Selection on Organizational Performance: The Case of Private owned Organizations in Erbil, North of Iraq. *Semanric Schollar*. <https://doi.org/10.15520/IJCRR%2F2018%2F9%2F02%2F422>